

Message Text

SECRET

PAGE 01 STATE 198364
ORIGIN NODS-00

INFO OCT-01 ISO-00 /001 R

DRAFTED BY NEA/IAI:CHILL:LM

APPROVED BY NEA:NAVELIOTES

IO/UNP:PSBRIDGES

S/S-O: SVALERGA

-----115551 052049Z/61

O 052034Z AUG 78 ZFF6

FM SECSTATE WASHDC

TO AMEMBASSY TEL AVIV IMMEDIATE

AMEMBASSY CAIRO IMMEDIATE

INFO USMISSION USUN NEW YORK IMMEDIATE

WHITE HOUSE 0000

S E C R E T STATE 198364

EXDIS DISTRIBUTE AS NODIS; FOR ATHERTON/SAUNDERS FROM NEA

E.O. 11652: GDS

TAGS: UN, MILI, US, IS

SUBJECT: NON-RENEWAL OF UNEF

REF: A) JERUSALEM 2108, B) JERUSALEM 2119 (USDEL 38)

1. SPECULATION ABOUT NON-RENEWAL OF UNEF HAS REACHED POINT WHERE WE THOUGHT A REVIEW OF THE BIDDING WITH SOME THOUGHTS FROM HERE COULD BE USEFUL FOR YOU IN CONTEXT CURRENT TRIP. WHAT FOLLOWS IS NOT FULLY CLEARED LEGAL BRIEF BUT OUR BEST WEEKEND EFFORT.

2. BRIEFLY, RECENT BACKGROUND IS THIS: IN EARLY MARCH INTERVIE'SADAT RESTATED HIS VIEW (FIRST HEARD SOON AFTER 1975 INITIALING OF THE AGREEMENT) THAT BOTH SINAI II DIS-

SECRET

SECRET

PAGE 02 STATE 198364

ENGAGEMENT AGREEMENT AND UNEF MANDATE EXPIRE IN OCTOBER. IN LATE JULY GAMASY ASKED SIILASVUO ABOUT CONSEQUENCES IF UNEF MANDATE NOT EXTENDED. SIILASVUO REPLIED (REFTEL A) THAT AUGMENTED UNTSO COULD TAKE OVER UNEF FUNCTIONS; SIILASVUO HAS ALSO GIVEN GUYER/URQUHART HIS VIEWS ON PLANNING FOR SUCH A CONTINGENCY. TOPIC OF UNEF RENEWAL ALSO CAME UP DURING ROY'S MEETING WITH BEGIN AUGUST 2 (REFTEL B).

BEGIN TOOK POSITION THAT SINAI II IS TO REMAIN IN FORCE
UNTIL SUPERSEDED BY ANOTHER AGREEMENT, BUT THAT UNEF RE-
NEWAL MAY BE ANOTHER MATTER.

3. IT STRIKES US THAT UNDER ARTICLE V OF AGREEMENT,
EGYPT AND ISRAEL UNDERTOOK TO RENEW AGREEMENT ANNUALLY AS
LONG AS AGREEMENT ITSELF CONTINUES. WE ARE AWARE OF "THREE
YEAR LIMIT" CLAIM BY SADAT BUT USG APPARENTLY HAS NEVER
ACQUIESCED IN IT AND WE FIND NO JUSTIFICATION FOR IT
EITHER IN SINAI II ITSELF OR IN SADAT SIDE LETTER OF SEP-
TEMBER 1, 1975. IN THAT LETTER, YOU MAY RECALL, SADAT
SET FORTH EGYPT'S POSITION AS A.) THE AGREEMENT REMAINS
IN FORCE UNTIL SUPERSEDED B.) EGYPT WILL MAKE EVERY EFFORT
TO EXTEND UNEF ANNUALLY FOR DURATION OF AGREEMENT AND C.)
IF THE SECURITY COUNCIL BY ACTION OF A THIRD STATE (I.E.,
A SOVIET VETO) FAILS TO RENEW UNEF, EGYPT WOULD WORK WITH
THE U.S. TO HAVE UNGA BRING ABOUT AT LEAST TWO ANNUAL RE-
NEWALS AFTER THE FIRST ANNUAL MANDATE (COMMENT: THIS IS
ONLY LANGUAGE THAT COMES CLOSE TO A THREE YEAR LIMIT; IT
DOES NOT, IN OUR OPINION, WARRANT CONCLUSION THAT UNEF'S
THREE YEARS ARE UP IN OCTOBER.) AND D.) IF UNGA ACTION NOT
POSSIBLE, EGYPT WOULD REQUEST AN AUGMENTED UNTSO TO TAKE
OVER FROM UNEF. (COMMENT: THIS UNTSO SUBSTITUTION COMMIT-
MENT APPEARS TO APPLY ONLY AS LAST RESORT IN EVENT OF
SECURITY COUNCIL FAILURE TO RENEW AS RESULT OF THIRD STATE
ACTION AND ONLY IF SUCH ACTION BLOCKED ONE OF FIRST THREE
SECRET

SECRET

PAGE 03 STATE 198364

ANNUAL RENEWALS).

4. ROSENNE'S COMMENTS (REFTEL B) ADD UP TO SIMILAR INTER-
PRETATION. ROSENNE MAKES ADDITIONAL POINT THAT UNLESS
BOTH EGYPT AND ISRAEL AGREE TO WITHDRAW UNEF, AGREE-
MENT TO ITS PRESENCE SHOULD REMAIN BINDING ON ALL SIDES.
PRESUMABLY THIS ALSO IS OUR VIEW AND WAS DELIBERATELY
DONE IN ORDER TO AVOID REPETITION OF 1967 UNILATERAL WITH-
DRAWAL OF UNEF, FOR AS BRITISH FOREIGN SECRETARY POINTED
OUT AT THAT TIME, "A PEACEKEEPING FORCE THAT CAN BE WITH-
DRAWN IN THE HOUR OF TENSION IS A MOCKERY". (COMMENT:
ROSENNE ALSO REFERS IN REFTEL B TO US-ISRAEL "AGREEMENT"
ON THIS. WE KNOW OF NO SUCH AGREEMENT).

5. IF FOREGOING IS ACCURATE, LETTER AND SPIRIT OF AGREE-
MENT WOULD SUPPORT INTERPRETATION THAT UNILATERAL DECI-
SION TO WITHDRAW UNEF NOW, IN OCTOBER, OR AT ANY TIME
DURING LIFE OF SINAI II WOULD AMOUNT TO WRONGFUL ABRO-
GATION. ISRAELIS UNDOUBTEDLY WOULD TRY TO MAKE MUCH OF
EGYPT'S "VIOLATION" OF SINAI II AND HARD-LINERS IN ISRAEL
WOULD POUNCE WITH GLEE ON "PROOF" THAT ARABS CANNOT BE
TRUSTED TO ADHERE TO INTERNATIONAL AGREEMENTS.

6. BUT WHATEVER THE LEGALITIES MAY BE WE RECOGNIZE THAT EGYPT, AS A SOVEREIGN STATE, CANNOT IN FACT BE PREVENTED FROM DECLARING ITS UNWILLINGNESS TO ACCEPT FURTHER UNEF ROLE. POINT TO BE MADE IN THIS REGARD, WE BELIEVE, IS THAT SUCH A STEP COULD ALL TOO EASILY BEGIN PROCESS OF

UNRAVELLING SINAI II THAT WOULD BE DIFFICULT IF NOT IMPOSSIBLE TO HALT.

7. IDEA THAT UNTSO COULD EASILY MOVE IN TO TAKE OVER UNEF RESPONSIBILITIES, IF IT GETS AROUND, MIGHT ENCOURAGE SADAT TO TAKE WHAT MAY APPEAR TO BE SYMBOLIC STEP IN FALSE CONFIDENCE THAT UN OR U.S. WILL STEP IN TO PREVENT ANY REAL SECRET

SECRET

PAGE 04 STATE 198364

DETERIORATION OF SITUATION. REALITY, WE EXPECT, WOULD BE OTHERWISE. WHETHER A NEW RENEWAL FORMULA FOR UNEF WERE PROPOSED (E.G., DROPPING BACK TO PRE-SINAI SIX OR THREE MONTHS RENEWALS) OR UNTSO OFFERED AS A SUBSTITUTE, SINAI II EITHER WOULD HAVE TO BE AMENDED OR PARTIES WOULD HAVE TO LOOK OTHER WAY AS ONE OF ITS FOUNDATION STONES -- ARTICLE V -- WAS PULLED OUT.

8. MOREOVER, NUMBER OF ASSUMPTIONS ABOUT UNTSO SUBSTITUTION MADE BY SIILASVUO CANNOT BE TAKEN FOR GRANTED. UNTSO IS SMALL, UNARMED ORGANIZATION; CONGRESS COULD BE COUNTED ON TO QUESTION WHETHER IT COULD PROVIDE ADEQUATE SECURITY FOR SINAI II FIELD MISSION. INDEED, CONGRESS' 1975 APPROVAL WAS ACHIEVED LARGELY AS A RESULT OF OUR ASSURANCES THAT BOTH EGYPT AND ISRAEL AGREED TO ENTIRE EARLY WARNING SYSTEM ARRANGEMENTS--INCLUDING UNEF. UN SECRETARIAT TOLD US IN 1975 THAT WALDHHEIM WOULD NEVER AGREE TO UNTSO REPLACING UNEF WITHOUT EXPLICIT AGREEMENT OF SECURITY COUNCIL. SUCH A PROCESS MIGHT OFFER SOVIETS AN OPPORTUNITY TO QUESTION VALIDITY OF PRESENT UNTSO MANDATE. IN SUM, POLITICAL PROBLEMS ON HILL AND AT UN WOULD BE CONSIDERABLE.

9. SHOULD YOU FEEL OCCASION APPROPRIATE, VISIT OF SECRETARY MAY BE TIME TO LET PARTIES KNOW THAT U.S. DOES NOT REGARD UNILATERAL DECISION TO WITHDRAW UNEF AS WARRANTED UNDER SINAI II AND THAT, IN ANY EVENT, SUCH A STEP WOULD DESTROY DELICATELY CONSTRUCTED, HIGHLY EFFECTIVE PEACEKEEPING MECHANISM WITH POTENTIALLY GRAVE CONSEQUENCES TO DISENGAGEMENT AGREEMENT ITSELF.

10. WHETHER ISSUE IS RAISED AT THIS TIME WITH EGYPTIANS OR NOT, WE FEEL THAT WE SHOULD TRY TO TURN OFF TALK ABOUT SECRET

SECRET

PAGE 05 STATE 198364

FEASIBILITY OF UNTSO SUBSTITUTION IN ORDER TO AVOID ENCOURAGING SADAT TO BELIEVE THAT DRAMATIC DECISION CAN BE PULLED OFF WITHOUT NEGATIVE CONSEQUENCES. IF PUBLIC STATEMENTS AND CONTINGENCY PLANNING GO ON MUCH LONGER, ISSUE MAY ATTAIN PROMINENT LIFE OF ITS OWN THAT WILL ALMOST GUARANTEE A CRISIS AS WE APPROACH OCTOBER.

11. USUN HAS ASKED US TO EMPHASIZE TO YOU THE NEED TO BE EXTREMELY CAREFUL IN ANY CONVERSATIONS WITH EGYPTIANS OR OTHERS, NOT TO REVEAL THAT WE HAVE BEEN MADE PRIVY TO INFORMATION FROM UN SERVICES. CHRISTOPHER

SECRET

NNN

Message Attributes

Automatic Decaptoning: X
Capture Date: 01 jan 1994
Channel Indicators: n/a
Current Classification: UNCLASSIFIED
Concepts: MILITARY ASSISTANCE, AGREEMENTS, PROGRAMS (PROJECTS), PROPOSALS (BID), FOREIGN ASSISTANCE, CAT-B
Control Number: n/a
Copy: SINGLE
Draft Date: 05 aug 1978
Decaption Date: 01 jan 1960
Decaption Note:
Disposition Action: RELEASED
Disposition Approved on Date:
Disposition Case Number: n/a
Disposition Comment: 25 YEAR REVIEW
Disposition Date: 20 Mar 2014
Disposition Event:
Disposition History: n/a
Disposition Reason:
Disposition Remarks:
Document Number: 1978STATE198364
Document Source: CORE
Document Unique ID: 00
Drafter: CHILL:LM
Enclosure: n/a
Executive Order: GS
Errors: N/A
Expiration:
Film Number: P840140-2179
Format: TEL
From: STATE NEA
Handling Restrictions: n/a
Image Path:
ISecure: 1
Legacy Key: link1978/newtext/t19780894/aaaadalo.tel
Line Count: 186
Litigation Code IDs:
Litigation Codes:
Litigation History:
Locator: TEXT ON-LINE, ON MICROFILM
Message ID: c4771d68-c288-dd11-92da-001cc4696bcc
Office: ORIGIN NODS
Original Classification: SECRET
Original Handling Restrictions: n/a
Original Previous Classification: n/a
Original Previous Handling Restrictions: NODIS, EXDIS
Page Count: 4
Previous Channel Indicators: n/a
Previous Classification: SECRET
Previous Handling Restrictions: NODIS, EXDIS
Reference: 78 JERUSALEM 2108, 78 JERUSALEM 2119
Retention: 0
Review Action: RELEASED, APPROVED
Review Content Flags:
Review Date: 27 jun 2005
Review Event:
Review Exemptions: n/a
Review Media Identifier:
Review Release Date: n/a
Review Release Event: n/a
Review Transfer Date:
Review Withdrawn Fields: n/a
SAS ID: 1824774
Secure: OPEN
Status: NATIVE
Subject: NON-RENEWAL OF UNEF
TAGS: MILI, US, IS, UN, UNEF
To: TEL AVIV CAIRO MULTIPLE
Type: TE
vdkvgwkey: odbc://SAS/SAS.dbo.SAS_Docs/c4771d68-c288-dd11-92da-001cc4696bcc
Review Markings:
Sheryl P. Walter
Declassified/Released
US Department of State
EO Systematic Review
20 Mar 2014
Markings: Sheryl P. Walter Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 20 Mar 2014